From: THE BORSCHKE FAMILY <borschkes@gmail.com> Sent: Tuesday, June 3, 2025 1:57 PM To: Christopher M. Kelly <ckelly@jonesday.com> Cc: Kathryn Tomita <tomitakathy@gmail.com>; Tadanori Tomita <ttomita@luriechildrens.org>; John DiLorenzo <jdilorenzo@miplanners.com>; GUS <ajborschke@gmail.com>; Vicki L. Smith <vicki.smith@mysanibel.com>; Holly Smith <Holly.Smith@mysanibel.com>

Subject: Hurricane Milton damage at 6494 SANIBEL Captiva Road

### This Message Is From an Untrusted Sender

**Report Suspicious** 

You have not previously corresponded with this sender.

Dear Chris,

We are writing you to let you know how damage from Hurricane Milton severely impacted the depth of the bay water in back our home. The mere fact that our property is across the street from the Gulf of Mexico is proof enough as to why the bay quickly filled with sand from the storm surge. The day after Milton we had to wait to return to our home as Sanibel Captiva Road was covered with sand that had been washed from the beach, across San Cap Road, across our property into the Bay. Once San Cap Road was accessible (from a large amount of work by the city of Sanibel) we were unable to access our home by car as our driveway, composed of pit shell and crushed shells, had been washed out into the bay leaving a hole approximately 6 feet deep and enough erosion to require about 60 tons of pit shell to replace it. Our pool was full of sand necessitating a complete professional pump out. Our garage and lower level of our house was filled with silt, our dock on the water was covered with silt from the sand and vegetation from our yard. Other debris such as mailboxes, boards, plastic, etc. were washed towards the bay and had to be cleaned from the mangroves and the water. Large heavy rocks and patio stones were also washed away from the power of the surge water. Based on the information provided, we strongly feel that our home, and the homes next to ours should be included in the dredging project to offset the damage caused by Hurricane Milton to our water access and quality. Please let us know if we can provide photos or other information to support justification for dredging behind our homes. Thanks for all your help

Sincerely, Susan and Gus Borschke 336-918-2408 From: John DiLorenzo <jdilorenzo@miplanners.com>
Sent: Tuesday, June 3, 2025 3:17 PM
To: ckelly@jonesday.com; Vicki L. Smith <vicki.smith@mysanibel.com>; Holly Smith <Holly.Smith@mysanibel.com>; Kathryn Tomita <tomitakathy@gmail.com>; August Borschke <ajborschke@gmail.com>; Dana A. Souza <Dana.Souza@mysanibel.com>
Subject: 6496 Sanibel Captiva Road

### This Message Is From an External Sender

Report Suspicious

This message came from outside your organization.

Dear Chris,

It is absolutely critical that anybody involved with the proposed dredging project for Sunset Bay understand how devastating the impacts from Hurricane Milton were to my property, as well as the neighbors to the north and south of me on Sanibel Captiva Road.

The amount of sand that washed through my property from the Gulf and into Sunset Bay caused significant negative and irreversible consequences for the future use of my site. As City records will indicate, I had been in the process of planning a very elaborate pool installation for the front (Gulf side) of my home and had spent months of time and tens of thousands of dollars on surveys, engineering and other related expenses in order to get this done. Fortunately, this project was not started or completed before Milton ransacked my lot. Once I saw the utter devastation caused by Milton and realized that my dream pool would have been absolutely destroyed by Milton, I promptly withdrew my permit applications.

The sand that accumulated in my yard destroyed the landscape I had started replacing after Ian, forced me to bring in 65 tons of shell to replace my driveway and killed several mature trees that subsequently required removal. The entire underside of my house was filled with sand, which destroyed everything that was being stored in that space.

As far as my frontage on Sunset Bay is concerned, it has been rendered virtually useless, as a result of the sand that poured into the bay from Hurricane Milton. My view is now predominantly bottomlands more often than not. I have to juggle the tides just to use my kayak, otherwise I cannot return to my home and have personally helped push out several boaters who were unfamiliar with the water situation and became stuck in front of my house. And, to compound this matter, I pay waterfront taxes, but cannot use my waterfront!! What could be more frustrating or self-defeating than this simple fact?

I have been informed that the dredging project on Sunset Bay will stop at the site of the former Castaways Marina. It is wildly absurd that our residences on Sanibel Captiva Road

(6494, 6496 and 6498) ARE NOT included in the proposed dredging project. We were substantially harmed by the impacts of Milton, experienced a reduction in property value from the impacts of Milton and had our riparian rights severely restricted because of Milton. Further, if our sites are not dredged, the sand that is left under our docks and in front of our homes will clearly migrate back into the dredged area, rendering the investment made in our area a complete waste of funds.

We want to be included in the dredging project. We deserve to be included in the dredging project. We need to be included in the dredging project. Frankly, excluding us is a blatant disservice to the aforementioned households.

We urge the reconsideration of the position that excludes us and sincerely appreciate any and all efforts to support our cause. We LOVE SANIBEL and want to enjoy all that it has to offer.

Sincerely,

### John F DiLorenzo CEO

T: (800) 674-9235 M: (586) 263-9000 F: (586) 263-0690

59259 Van Dyke AVE Washington, MI 48094 www.miplanners.com

### From: Dan Hinckley <dbh@suiattle.org>

Sent: Tuesday, June 3, 2025 7:45 PM

To: Mike Miller < Mike.Miller@mysanibel.com>; Holly Smith <Holly.Smith@mysanibel.com>; Laura J. DeBruce <laura.debruce@mysanibel.com>; John.Henshaw@mysanibel; com.Mike.Miller@mysanibel.com; citymanager <citymanager@mysanibel.com>; Holly Milbrandt <Holly.Milbrandt@mysanibel.com> Cc: Hinckley Katherine <kph@suiattle.org>; Michael Kluth <kluthdds@msn.com>; llsikon@comcast.net; Barclay Meg < meg.barclay12@gmail.com >; catherine bannister <cathiebannister@gmail.com>; megvborn@icloud.com; Fields Ron <georgiaf@roadrunner.com>; cloiselle@yahoo.com; vloiselle@gmail.com; MAUGHAN BARBARA <barbara@maughan.com>; Jason R. Maughn <JM@mhalawgroup.com>; Baumgartner Betsy <Betsy.Baumgartner@gmail.com>; Baumgartner Bill <wbaumgar@ihmi.edu>; Funchion Matt <mfunchion@pennbeer.com>; dianafunchion@gmail.com; amymcneil83@gmail.com; Karenvollmer@me.com; anneentwistle@juno.com; Entwistle Anne <Erik@erikentwistle.com>; Weinstein Penny <penelopeart@comcast.net>; Castellitto Gloria <gcastellitto@aol.com>; Diane Roach <dmlr57@gmail.com>; Caroline Peirce <cpeirce27@comcast.net>; tsenft@sbcglobal.net; Jennifer Shaver <jldrenik19@gmail.com>; docshaver@twc.com; rushcom@aol.com; William Gerhardt <willgerhardt4@gmail.com>; hhgerhardt@yahoo.com; Wolfe Steve <wolfesteve@aol.com>; John Noel <johnnoelct@gmail.com>; Harrington John <harrinj@comcast.net>; Marston Deborah <dahbs@comcast.net>; Stafford Dave <djs@staffordsmith.com>; Stafford Linda <lgs1@staffordsmith.com>; jsmajeski@aol.com; paul@musictrades.com; SARAH WILSON <sarahwilsonprivate@me.com>; kay@kaycasperson.com; catherineloanderson@gmail.com; eanderson@forthrightsolutions.com; mikeqmm@gmail.com; Doug Born <dborn1957@gmail.com>; grace4td2@icloud.com; judy.bellistri@gmail.com; kitty koch <kittybaconkoch@gmail.com>; gfb55@hotmail.com; sanibelsas53@hotmail.com; anngrahamalfes@gmail.com; Susan Newton <susannewton881@gmail.com>; merrillbp@gmail.com; Paul Tiffany <paultiffany1@gmail.com>; janettiffany@hotmail.com; mggriffith1@gmail.com; Debi Griffith <nhizmij@gmail.com>; jenni@maughan.com; bruce.grossnickle@gmail.com; Jeanne.grossnickle@gmail.com; Karim Nashashibi <knashashibi@verizon.net>; gyoung@american.edu; MCCABE John <mccajohn@gmail.com>; b2cool@gmail.com; cooley.1@osu.edu; susan@coile.com; garth@garthwebb.com; nwine9@gmail.com; Krahmer Nancy <krahmer6@verizon.net>; Chad <ckrahmer@baystatefinancial.com>; Calkin Mark <mtcalkin@comcast.net>; Calkin Missy <melissa.calkin@gmail.com>; Klutch Joan <ajklutch1@gmail.com>; Klutch Joan <jklutch@mac.com>; amaazen1@gmail.com; vandermaazendot1@gmail.com; john314lot@gmail.com; bcneillirwin@gmail.com; rsbcsb <rsbcsb@aol.com>; cshieldsb@aol.com; blogie777@outlook.com; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <ursvonteuffel@yahoo.de>; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <vteuffel@hansalawyers.com>; cadumford@gmail.com; Smith Jack <Smit9188@gmail.com>; Katherine & Dan Hinckley <kph\_dbh@suiattle.org>; Murphy Alison <murphyalison@yahoo.com>; Murphy Brian <murph719@gmail.com>; Lord Rhonda <rhondalord13@gmail.com>; West Wendy <fishcrowroad@gmail.com>; boogatti@aol.com; doliboar@yahoo.com;

schmitmd@yahoo.com; sbbrowns@yahoo.com; tammyheadley@me.com; Wolfe Samantha <wolfechip@hotmail.com>; Wendy Harris <weceharris@gmail.com>; cfharris71@gmail.com; Jthbax@gmail.com; islandarch1@aol.com; christina Zeller <czellerdesign@gmail.com>; pfridlington@gmail.com; jwfrid@gmail.com; William horvath@yahoo.com; Dokrobin@yahoo.com; kenfanning@comcast.net; Lori Fanning <rosapines2@comcast.net>; Heidi.mazel@yahoo.com; carolsawyer7@aol.com; toxdoc1@comcast.net; carol ruot <Carolruot@gmail.com>; mmxxxvii@hotmail.com; lauren callahan <callahanlc1@gmail.com>; mcallahan@tdmgo.com; jerrytm@me.com; terrytm@me.com; stm@alexphire.com; pmcclure@alexphire.com; Galante Alicia <aliciagalante@att.net>; Galante Carl <cgalante@att.net>; Gill Lisa <LisaGill215@comcast.net>; Wright Peter <prockwellwright@gmail.com>; patricia.h.newman@gmail.com; Behrens Pamela <pbehrens56@aol.com>; mikeandkarencox@gmail.com; Salvisa2Sanibel@gmail.com; peteo@opcconstruction.com; amm45ann@aol.com; Sebree Nancy <nsebree@msn.com>; Reik Karl <santiva60@comcast.net>; Tim Huyck <thuyck@comcast.net>; Louise Huyck <weezieh@comcast.net>; Vogler Maria <msvogler@comcast.net>; sanibeloasis@gmail.com; jbbalas@gmail.com; sh102j@aol.com; Mullins Cannella <mcm.captiva@gmail.com>; katiefpadgett@gmail.com; mark@gmail.com; Woodham Greg <rwoodham3@comcast.net>; Ortwein Bernie M. <bernard.ortwein@gmail.com>; Semmelman Karen L. <ksemmelman@gmail.com>; elgoldman@goldmangallery.com; blgoldman@goldmangallery.com; Scholz John <john@scholzandbarclay.com>; Harry & Sally <hrj1946@cox.net>; James Reidel <logatorial@gmail.com>; AICP James H. McNeil <jim.mcneil@akerman.com>

Subject: Wilfert Dinkins Dredging Project

# This Message Is From an External Sender

Report Suspicious

This message came from outside your organization.

Dear Council Members,

We watched the debate on Resolution 25-024 with much interest, as we are abutters of Dinkins Bayou.

### 1)

While we learned a great deal, one issue stands out as the single thing that no one mentioned. There seems to be great interest in awarding the dredging contract by Sept 1. However, it appears that awarding that contract automatically triggers the creation of the SAD, unless we are mistaken.

That seems like getting the cart before the horse. If indeed that SAD is to be created, it should happen \*\*before\*\* awarding a contract, not because of awarding it.

Please take this into consideration.

# 2)

It is very apparent that solving the Wulfert issue is quite straightforward and would solve access issues for many of the boaters the area, with perhaps the exception of Sunset Bay.

You heard from a neighbor, Nicolas Weyers, that he is prepared to do that dredging immediately. The City would definitely be remiss if it did not immediately investigate this opportunity.

# 3)

It was clear that only two Council members recall the details of the Blind Pass Inlet Management Plan. We participated actively in the hearings for that plan, and as Holly mentioned, it includes solving the Sunset Bay issue. That plan was hugely improved by us participants demonstrating to the engineering firm that the old Blind Pass passages through Sunset Bay would vastly improve the water flow through Blind Pass and the Wulfert Channel. It is true as she said, that enabling the Preferred Option (Option 5) would need additional permitting but this is something Sanibel hopefully should be able to lobby Lee County DNR about.

BPIMP was also justified on environmental grounds, and thus supported by FL DEP. As a consequence, we would be remiss not to immediately seek all possible alternatives to restarting the permitting of the preferred option for that plan, especially given that short-term solutions are available while such lobbying proceeds.

# 4)

There was much discussion about this project being about navigational safety. But unless I am mistaken, that is not the responsibility of the City. Wulfert Channel and Dinkins Bayou are not man-made canals; they are Navigable Waters within the meaning of the act, and as such are the responsibility of the USACE (US Army Corps of Engineers), (please see sections of the US CFR attached) thus subject to USACE oversight.

Navigation safety on the waters of the US is almost certainly the responsibility of the Coast Guard, not the City. I doubt that using it as a justification for the project is a defensible position.

# 5)

Having spent many years navigating Dinkins Bayou, including the Pine Tree canal and beyond, we can say clearly that the dredging issues in the upper reaches of the Bayou are exaggerated. There are indeed shoal spots, which can be avoided with skill and attention.

Again, this is a place where Mr Weyers could likely solve any issues quickly and inexpensively, and more importantly without the necessity for an SAD.

We can assert from personal observation of Dinkins Bayou from Feb 5 - May 22, 2025, that large outboards of 23 - 26 ft. with 1 or 2 engines were successfully leaving the Bayou during that period. Their most serious issue is very likely the shoal in the Wulfert Channel.

# 6)

This project is overkill. The affected dredging areas are small (with the exception of Sunset Bay) and easily, quickly and most importantly, inexpensively solved without burdening abutters with unnecessary tax burdens.

We remain totally opposed to this project both in its scope as currently defined, and especially in the financing approach being considered.

Sincerely,

Katherine and Dan Hinckley 2498 Harbour Lane Sanibel, FL 33957

-----

US CFR:

#### https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-33/chapter-II/part-329 https://www.nap.usace.army.mil/Portals/39/docs/regulatory/regs/33cfr329.pdf § 329.4 General definition.

Navigable waters of the United States are those waters that are subject to the ebb and flow of the tide and/or are presently used, or have been used in the past, or may be susceptible for use to transport interstate or foreign commerce. A determination of navigability, once made, applies laterally over the entire surface of the waterbody, and is not extinguished by later actions or events which impede or destroy navigable capacity.

### § 329.7 Intrastate or interstate nature of waterway.

A waterbody may be entirely within a state, yet still be capable of carrying interstate commerce. This is especially clear when it physically connects with a generally acknowledged avenue of interstate commerce, such as the ocean or one of the Great Lakes, and is yet wholly within one state. Nor is it necessary that there be a physically navigable connection across a state boundary. Where a waterbody extends through one or more states, but substantial portions, which are capable of bearing interstate commerce, are located in only one of the states, the entirety of the waterway up to the head (upper limit) of navigation is subject to Federal jurisdiction.

### 329.12 Geographic and jurisdictional limits of oceanic and tidal waters.

(a) **Ocean and coastal waters.** The navigable waters of the United States over which Corps of Engineers regulatory jurisdiction extends include all ocean and coastal waters within a zone three geographic (nautical) miles seaward from the baseline (The Territorial Seas). Wider zones are recognized for special regulatory powers exercised over the outer continental shelf. (See <u>33 CFR 322.3(b)</u>).

From: Michael Kluth <kluthDDS@msn.com> Sent: Tuesday, June 3, 2025 9:18 PM To: Dan Hinckley <dbh@suiattle.org> Cc: Mike Miller < Mike. Miller @mysanibel.com>; Holly Smith <Holly.Smith@mysanibel.com>; Laura J. DeBruce <laura.debruce@mysanibel.com>; John.Henshaw@mysanibel; com.Mike.Miller@mysanibel.com; citymanager <citymanager@mysanibel.com>; Holly Milbrandt <Holly.Milbrandt@mysanibel.com>; Katherine Hinckley <kph@suiattle.org>; llsikon@comcast.net; Meg Barclay <meg.barclay12@gmail.com>; catherine bannister <cathiebannister@gmail.com>; megvborn@icloud.com; Ron Fields <georgiaf@roadrunner.com>; cloiselle@yahoo.com; vloiselle@gmail.com; BARBARA MAUGHAN <barbara@maughan.com>; Jason R. Maughn <JM@mhalawgroup.com>; Betsy Baumgartner <Betsy.Baumgartner@gmail.com>; Bill Baumgartner <wbaumgar@ihmi.edu>; Funchion Matt <mfunchion@pennbeer.com>; dianafunchion@gmail.com; amymcneil83@gmail.com; Karenvollmer@me.com; anneentwistle@juno.com; Anne Entwistle <Erik@erikentwistle.com>; Penny Weinstein <penelopeart@comcast.net>; Gloria Castellitto <gcastellitto@aol.com>; Diane Roach <dmlr57@gmail.com>; Caroline Peirce <cpeirce27@comcast.net>; tsenft@sbcglobal.net; Jennifer Shaver <jldrenik19@gmail.com>; docshaver@twc.com; rushcom@aol.com; William Gerhardt <willgerhardt4@gmail.com>; hhgerhardt@yahoo.com; Steve Wolfe <wolfesteve@aol.com>; John Noel <johnnoelct@gmail.com>; John Harrington <harrinj@comcast.net>; Deborah Marston <dahbs@comcast.net>; Dave Stafford <djs@staffordsmith.com>; Linda Stafford <lgs1@staffordsmith.com>; jsmajeski@aol.com; paul@musictrades.com; SARAH WILSON <sarahwilsonprivate@me.com>; kay@kaycasperson.com; catherineloanderson@gmail.com; eanderson@forthrightsolutions.com; mikeqmm@gmail.com; Doug Born <dborn1957@gmail.com>; grace4td2@icloud.com; judy.bellistri@gmail.com; kitty koch <kittybaconkoch@gmail.com>; gfb55@hotmail.com; sanibelsas53@hotmail.com; anngrahamalfes@gmail.com; Susan Newton <susannewton881@gmail.com>; merrillbp@gmail.com; Tiffany Paul <paultiffany1@gmail.com>; janettiffany@hotmail.com; mggriffith1@gmail.com; Debi Griffith <nhizmij@gmail.com>; jenni@maughan.com; bruce.grossnickle@gmail.com; Jeanne.grossnickle@gmail.com; Karim Nashashibi <knashashibi@verizon.net>; gyoung@american.edu; John MCCABE <mccajohn@gmail.com>; b2cool@gmail.com; cooley.1@osu.edu; susan@coile.com; garth@garthwebb.com; nwine9@gmail.com; Nancy Krahmer <krahmer6@verizon.net>; Chad <ckrahmer@baystatefinancial.com>; Mark Calkin <mtcalkin@comcast.net>; Missy Calkin <melissa.calkin@gmail.com>; Joan Klutch <ajklutch1@gmail.com>; Joan Klutch <jklutch@mac.com>; amaazen1@gmail.com; vandermaazendot1@gmail.com; john314lot@gmail.com; bcneillirwin@gmail.com; rsbcsb <rsbcsb@aol.com>; cshieldsb@aol.com; blogie777@outlook.com; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <ursvonteuffel@yahoo.de>; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <vteuffel@hansalawyers.com>; cadumford@gmail.com; Jack Smith <smit9188@gmail.com>; Katherine Dan Hinckley <kph\_dbh@suiattle.org>; Alison Murphy <murphyalison@yahoo.com>; Brian Murphy <murph719@gmail.com>; Rhonda Lord <rhondalord13@gmail.com>; Wendy West <fishcrowroad@gmail.com>; boogatti@aol.com; doliboar@yahoo.com;

schmitmd@yahoo.com; sbbrowns@yahoo.com; tammyheadley@me.com; Samantha Wolfe <wolfechip@hotmail.com>; Wendy Harris <weceharris@gmail.com>; cfharris71@gmail.com; Jthbax@gmail.com; islandarch1@aol.com; christina Zeller <czellerdesign@gmail.com>; pfridlington@gmail.com; jwfrid@gmail.com; William horvath@yahoo.com; Dokrobin@yahoo.com; kenfanning@comcast.net; Lori Fanning <rosapines2@comcast.net>; Heidi.mazel@yahoo.com; carolsawyer7@aol.com; toxdoc1@comcast.net; carol ruot <Carolruot@gmail.com>; mmxxxvii@hotmail.com; lauren callahan <callahanlc1@gmail.com>; mcallahan@tdmgo.com; jerrytm@me.com; terrytm@me.com; stm@alexphire.com; pmcclure@alexphire.com; Alicia Galante <aliciagalante@att.net>; Carl Galante <cgalante@att.net>; Lisa Gill <LisaGill215@comcast.net>; Peter Wright <prockwellwright@gmail.com>; patricia.h.newman@gmail.com; Pamela Behrens <pbehrens56@aol.com>; mikeandkarencox@gmail.com; Salvisa2Sanibel@gmail.com; peteo@opcconstruction.com; amm45ann@aol.com; Nancy Sebree <nsebree@msn.com>; Karl Reik <santiva60@comcast.net>; Tim Huyck <thuyck@comcast.net>; Louise Huyck <weezieh@comcast.net>; Maria Vogler <msvogler@comcast.net>; sanibeloasis@gmail.com; jbbalas@gmail.com; sh102j@aol.com; Cannella Mullins <mcm.captiva@gmail.com>; katiefpadgett@gmail.com; mark@gmail.com; Greg Woodham <rwoodham3@comcast.net>; Bernie M. Ortwein <bernard.ortwein@gmail.com>; Semmelman Karen L. <ksemmelman@gmail.com>; elgoldman@goldmangallery.com; blgoldman@goldmangallery.com; John Scholz <john@scholzandbarclay.com>; Harry Sally <hrj1946@cox.net>; James Reidel <logatorial@gmail.com>; AICP James H. McNeil <jim.mcneil@akerman.com>

Subject: Re: Wilfert Dinkins Dredging Project

# This Message Is From an Untrusted Sender

**Report Suspicious** 

You have not previously corresponded with this sender.

Well quilled !!

Sent from my iPhone

From: Dan Hinckley <dbh@suiattle.org> Sent: Tuesday, June 3, 2025 7:45 PM To: Mike Miller <Mike.Miller@mysanibel.com>; Holly Smith <Holly.Smith@mysanibel.com>; Laura J. DeBruce <laura.debruce@mysanibel.com>; John.Henshaw@mysanibel; com.Mike.Miller@mysanibel.com; citymanager <citymanager@mysanibel.com>; Holly Milbrandt <Holly.Milbrandt@mysanibel.com> Cc: Hinckley Katherine <kph@suiattle.org>; Michael Kluth <kluthdds@msn.com>; llsikon@comcast.net; Barclay Meg <meg.barclay12@gmail.com>; catherine bannister

<cathiebannister@gmail.com>; megvborn@icloud.com; Fields Ron <georgiaf@roadrunner.com>; cloiselle@yahoo.com; vloiselle@gmail.com; MAUGHAN BARBARA <barbara@maughan.com>; Jason R. Maughn <JM@mhalawgroup.com>; Baumgartner Betsy <Betsy.Baumgartner@gmail.com>; Baumgartner Bill <wbaumgar@jhmi.edu>; Funchion Matt <mfunchion@pennbeer.com>; dianafunchion@gmail.com; amymcneil83@gmail.com; Karenvollmer@me.com; anneentwistle@juno.com; Entwistle Anne <Erik@erikentwistle.com>; Weinstein Penny <penelopeart@comcast.net>; Castellitto Gloria <gcastellitto@aol.com>; Diane Roach <dmlr57@gmail.com>; Caroline Peirce <cpeirce27@comcast.net>; tsenft@sbcglobal.net; Jennifer Shaver <ildrenik19@gmail.com>; docshaver@twc.com; rushcom@aol.com; William Gerhardt <willgerhardt4@gmail.com>; hhgerhardt@yahoo.com; Wolfe Steve <wolfesteve@aol.com>; John Noel <johnnoelct@gmail.com>; Harrington John <harrinj@comcast.net>; Marston Deborah <dahbs@comcast.net>; Stafford Dave <djs@staffordsmith.com>; Stafford Linda <lgs1@staffordsmith.com>; jsmajeski@aol.com; paul@musictrades.com; SARAH WILSON <sarahwilsonprivate@me.com>; kay@kaycasperson.com; catherineloanderson@gmail.com; eanderson@forthrightsolutions.com; mikeqmm@gmail.com; Doug Born <dborn1957@gmail.com>; grace4td2@icloud.com; judy.bellistri@gmail.com; kitty koch <kittybaconkoch@gmail.com>; gfb55@hotmail.com; sanibelsas53@hotmail.com; anngrahamalfes@gmail.com; Susan Newton <susannewton881@gmail.com>; merrillbp@gmail.com; Paul Tiffany <paultiffany1@gmail.com>; janettiffany@hotmail.com; mggriffith1@gmail.com; Debi Griffith <nhizmij@gmail.com>; jenni@maughan.com; bruce.grossnickle@gmail.com; Jeanne.grossnickle@gmail.com; Karim Nashashibi <knashashibi@verizon.net>; gyoung@american.edu; MCCABE John <mccajohn@gmail.com>; b2cool@gmail.com; cooley.1@osu.edu; susan@coile.com; garth@garthwebb.com; nwine9@gmail.com; Krahmer Nancy <krahmer6@verizon.net>; Chad <ckrahmer@baystatefinancial.com>; Calkin Mark <mtcalkin@comcast.net>; Calkin Missy <melissa.calkin@gmail.com>; Klutch Joan <ajklutch1@gmail.com>; Klutch Joan <jklutch@mac.com>; amaazen1@gmail.com; vandermaazendot1@gmail.com; john314lot@gmail.com; bcneillirwin@gmail.com; rsbcsb <rsbcsb@aol.com>; cshieldsb@aol.com; blogie777@outlook.com; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <ursvonteuffel@yahoo.de>; Dr. von Teuffel Niko Frhr. <vteuffel@hansalawyers.com>; cadumford@gmail.com; Smith Jack <Smit9188@gmail.com>; Katherine & Dan Hinckley <kph\_dbh@suiattle.org>; Murphy Alison <murphyalison@yahoo.com>; Murphy Brian <murph719@gmail.com>; Lord Rhonda <rhondalord13@gmail.com>; West Wendy <fishcrowroad@gmail.com>; boogatti@aol.com; doliboar@yahoo.com; schmitmd@yahoo.com; sbbrowns@yahoo.com; tammyheadley@me.com; Wolfe Samantha <wolfechip@hotmail.com>; Wendy Harris <weceharris@gmail.com>; cfharris71@gmail.com; Jthbax@gmail.com; islandarch1@aol.com; christina Zeller <czellerdesign@gmail.com>; pfridlington@gmail.com; jwfrid@gmail.com; William\_horvath@yahoo.com; Dokrobin@yahoo.com; kenfanning@comcast.net; Lori Fanning <rosapines2@comcast.net>; Heidi.mazel@yahoo.com; carolsawyer7@aol.com; toxdoc1@comcast.net; carol ruot <Carolruot@gmail.com>; mmxxxvii@hotmail.com; lauren callahan <callahanlc1@gmail.com>; mcallahan@tdmgo.com; jerrytm@me.com;

terrytm@me.com; stm@alexphire.com; pmcclure@alexphire.com; Galante Alicia <aliciagalante@att.net>; Galante Carl <cgalante@att.net>; Gill Lisa <LisaGill215@comcast.net>; Wright Peter <prockwellwright@gmail.com>; patricia.h.newman@gmail.com; Behrens Pamela <pbehrens56@aol.com>; mikeandkarencox@gmail.com; Salvisa2Sanibel@gmail.com; peteo@opcconstruction.com; amm45ann@aol.com; Sebree Nancy <nsebree@msn.com>; Reik Karl <santiva60@comcast.net>; Tim Huyck <thuyck@comcast.net>; Louise Huyck <weezieh@comcast.net>; Vogler Maria <msvogler@comcast.net>; sanibeloasis@gmail.com; jbbalas@gmail.com; sh102j@aol.com; Mullins Cannella <mcm.captiva@gmail.com>; katiefpadgett@gmail.com; mark@gmail.com; Woodham Greg <rwoodham3@comcast.net>; Ortwein Bernie M. <bernard.ortwein@gmail.com>; Semmelman Karen L. <ksemmelman@gmail.com>; elgoldman@goldmangallery.com; blgoldman@goldmangallery.com; Scholz John <john@scholzandbarclay.com>; Harry & Sally <hrj1946@cox.net>; James Reidel <logatorial@gmail.com>; AICP James H. McNeil <jim.mcneil@akerman.com>

Subject: Wilfert Dinkins Dredging Project

# This Message Is From an External Sender

**Report Suspicious** 

This message came from outside your organization.

Dear Council Members,

We watched the debate on Resolution 25-024 with much interest, as we are abutters of Dinkins Bayou.

### 1)

While we learned a great deal, one issue stands out as the single thing that no one mentioned. There seems to be great interest in awarding the dredging contract by Sept 1. However, it appears that awarding that contract automatically triggers the creation of the SAD, unless we are mistaken.

That seems like getting the cart before the horse. If indeed that SAD is to be created, it should happen \*\*before\*\* awarding a contract, not because of awarding it.

Please take this into consideration.

### 2)

It is very apparent that solving the Wulfert issue is quite straightforward and would solve access issues for many of the boaters the area, with perhaps the exception of Sunset Bay.

You heard from a neighbor, Nicolas Weyers, that he is prepared to do that dredging immediately. The City would definitely be remiss if it did not immediately investigate this opportunity.

# 3)

It was clear that only two Council members recall the details of the Blind Pass Inlet Management Plan. We participated actively in the hearings for that plan, and as Holly mentioned, it includes solving the Sunset Bay issue. That plan was hugely improved by us participants demonstrating to the engineering firm that the old Blind Pass passages through Sunset Bay would vastly improve the water flow through Blind Pass and the Wulfert Channel. It is true as she said, that enabling the Preferred Option (Option 5) would need additional permitting but this is something Sanibel hopefully should be able to lobby Lee County DNR about.

BPIMP was also justified on environmental grounds, and thus supported by FL DEP. As a consequence, we would be remiss not to immediately seek all possible alternatives to restarting the permitting of the preferred option for that plan, especially given that short-term solutions are available while such lobbying proceeds.

# 4)

There was much discussion about this project being about navigational safety. But unless I am mistaken, that is not the responsibility of the City. Wulfert Channel and Dinkins Bayou are not man-made canals; they are Navigable Waters within the meaning of the act, and as such are the responsibility of the USACE (US Army Corps of Engineers), (please see sections of the US CFR attached) thus subject to USACE oversight.

Navigation safety on the waters of the US is almost certainly the responsibility of the Coast Guard, not the City. I doubt that using it as a justification for the project is a defensible position.

# 5)

Having spent many years navigating Dinkins Bayou, including the Pine Tree canal and beyond, we can say clearly that the dredging issues in the upper reaches of the Bayou are exaggerated. There are indeed shoal spots, which can be avoided with skill and attention. Again, this is a place where Mr Weyers could likely solve any issues quickly and inexpensively, and more importantly without the necessity for an SAD.

We can assert from personal observation of Dinkins Bayou from Feb 5 - May 22, 2025, that large outboards of 23 - 26 ft. with 1 or 2 engines were successfully leaving the Bayou during that period. Their most serious issue is very likely the shoal in the Wulfert Channel.

This project is overkill. The affected dredging areas are small (with the exception of Sunset Bay) and easily, quickly and most importantly, inexpensively solved without burdening abutters with unnecessary tax burdens.

We remain totally opposed to this project both in its scope as currently defined, and especially in the financing approach being considered.

Sincerely,

Katherine and Dan Hinckley 2498 Harbour Lane Sanibel, FL 33957

-----

US CFR:

# https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-33/chapter-II/part-329 https://www.nap.usace.army.mil/Portals/39/docs/regulatory/regs/33cfr329.pdf

### § 329.4 General definition.

Navigable waters of the United States are those waters that are subject to the ebb and flow of the tide and/or are presently used, or have been used in the past, or may be susceptible for use to transport interstate or foreign commerce. A determination of navigability, once made, applies laterally over the entire surface of the waterbody, and is not extinguished by later actions or events which impede or destroy navigable capacity. **§ 329.7 Intrastate or interstate nature of waterway.** 

#### **8 329.7 Intrastate or interstate nature of waterway.** A waterbody may be entirely within a state, yet still be canable

A waterbody may be entirely within a state, yet still be capable of carrying interstate commerce. This is especially clear when it physically connects with a generally acknowledged avenue of interstate commerce, such as the ocean or one of the Great Lakes, and is yet wholly within one state. Nor is it necessary that there be a physically navigable connection across a state boundary. Where a waterbody extends through one or more states, but substantial portions, which are capable of bearing interstate commerce, are located in only one of the states, the entirety of the waterway up to the head (upper limit) of navigation is subject to Federal jurisdiction.

### 329.12 Geographic and jurisdictional limits of oceanic and tidal waters.

(a) **Ocean and coastal waters.** The navigable waters of the United States over which Corps of Engineers regulatory jurisdiction extends include all ocean and coastal waters within a zone three geographic (nautical) miles seaward from the baseline (The Territorial Seas). Wider zones are recognized for special regulatory powers exercised over the outer continental shelf. (See <u>33 CFR 322.3(b)</u>).

From: Doug Billings <billingsd62@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, June 4, 2025 6:05 PM
To: Vicki L. Smith <vicki.smith@mysanibel.com>
Cc: Jenny Billings <jennyelb@yahoo.com>; Holly Milbrandt
<Holly.Milbrandt@mysanibel.com>
Subject: Re: Wulfert channel assessment questions

This Message Is From an Untrusted Sender

Report Suspicious

You have not previously corresponded with this sender.

One additional question. How can I get a copy of all of the email communications from residents sent in advance of the council meeting yesterday June 3?

On Wednesday, June 4, 2025 at 04:28:10 PM EDT, Doug Billings <<u>billingsd62@yahoo.com</u>> wrote:

One additional question/comment.

The letter sent by the town clearly expressed "safety" as the rational for the district. What are the statistics on safety related incidents - deaths, injury, boat damage - associated with the proposed areas of dredging.

Thank you.

Doug

On Wednesday, June 4, 2025 at 03:01:41 PM EDT, Doug Billings <<u>billingsd62@yahoo.com</u>> wrote:

Vicki

Thank you for your note below. Regarding my questions below. In the town meeting I was able to get the information for answering question 3 below but not questions 1 and 2. I have not heard anything back from the Natural Resource Directors as of yet.

Could you help me follow up with the natural resource director? Also with regards to question 1 there were comments by the town manager about the current assessments that make we want to understand those in more detail. I would like the full details about those current assessment districts.

Thank you for your continued assistance on this.

Doug Billings 6101 Starling Way Sanibel Florida, 33957

On Sunday, June 1, 2025 at 05:29:59 PM EDT, Vicki L. Smith <<u>vicki.smith@mysanibel.com</u>> wrote:

Thank you for your comments. Your email will be included in the record of next week's meeting. I am also forwarding to our Natural Resources Director who will be able to answer your questions, Vicki

Vicki L. Smith Paralegal / Executive Assistant City Attorney / City Manager's Office City of Sanibel 800 Dunlop Road Sanibel, FL 33957 (239)472-4359 Ext. 323 (239)300-1839 (Cell)

City Website: <u>www.mysanibel.com</u> Email Address: <u>vicki.smith@mysanibel.com</u>

PLEASE NOTE: Florida has a very broad public records law. Most written communications to or from the City of Sanibel regarding City business are public records available to the public and media upon request. Your email communications, including your email address, may be subject to public disclosure.

From: Doug Billings <<u>billingsd62@yahoo.com</u>> Sent: Sunday, June 1, 2025 12:32 PM To: Vicki L. Smith <<u>vicki.smith@mysanibel.com</u>> Cc: Jenny Billings <<u>jennyelb@yahoo.com</u>> Subject: Wulfert channel assessment questions

Vicki I hope this note finds you doing well. I am a resident that would be affected by the proposed special assessment district for dredging of the Wulfert Channel, Sunset Bay and Dinkins Bayou. In advance of the town council meeting on Tuesday Vicki

I hope this note finds you doing well. I am a resident that would be affected by the proposed special assessment district for dredging of the Wulfert Channel, Sunset Bay and Dinkins Bayou. In advance of the town council meeting on Tuesday which I plan on attending, I have a couple of background questions I would appreciate the answers regarding. Specifically:

 what are the prior and/or existing special assessment districts that have been established by Sanibel, what were their purposes and durations?
 the letter we received says that the ongoing \$1,200 a year assessment would be collected as part of the Lee County annual tax assessment. Will those funds then be transferred to Sanibel from the County or held by the County?
 what will done with the materials dredged? Will it be removed entirely from the area.

3. what will done with the materials dredged? Will it be removed entirely from the area or deposited to other parts of these areas?

Thank you for any information you can provide as soon as you can on these questions.

Doug Billings 6101 Starling Way Sanibel Florida 508 878 9067.