



Meeting Minutes - Draft

Historical Preservation Committee

Thursday, January 5, 2023

9:00 AM

BIG ARTS - 900 Dunlop Road

1. Call To Order

The meeting convened at 9:30 a.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

3. Roll Call

Present: 5 - Chairperson Deborah Gleason, Committee Member Yvonne Hill, Committee Member Zachary McLendon, Committee Member Patricia Norton and Committee Member Troy Thompson

Absent: 4 - Vice Chair Clivie Goodwin, Committee Member Leslie Adams, Committee Member Sheila Fortney and Committee Member Jim Pickens

a. Motion to excuse any absent member(s)

Committee Member McLendon moved, seconded by Committee Member Hill to excuse absent members: Fortney, Goodwin and Adams. The motion carried.

Committee Member McLendon moved, seconded by Committee Member Hill to excuse absent members: Fortney, Goodwin, Pickens and Adams. The motion carried.

Excused: 4 - Vice Chair Goodwin, Committee Member Adams, Committee Member Fortney and Committee Member Pickens

4. Consent Agenda

a. Approval of the Historical Preservation Committee December 1, 2022, meeting minutes

Committee Member Thompson moved, seconded by Committee Member Norton to adopt the December 1, 2022 meeting minutes. The motion carried.

Excused: 4 - Vice Chair Goodwin, Committee Member Adams, Committee Member Fortney and Committee Member Pickens

5. Public Comment

No public were in attendance at this time.

6. Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness

a. Consideration of an application by the Historic Preservation Committee to provide a recommendation to the Planning Commission regarding amending Resolution 91-86 for the demolition or removal of the

Nutt Home (aka Gray Gables) on the Nutt Homestead located at 3405 West Gulf Drive (tax parcel No.28-46-22-T3-00007.0000) from the City Register of Historic Landmarks. The application is submitted by Robert H. Young and Florence Cowles Hamlett Young, the owners. **Application CA-2022-92**

Chair Gleason introduced the item as they left off in their last meeting and detailed the information included in the staff memorandum attached in the agenda packet.

The committee inquired of staff if the applicant intends to demolish the home. Which Ms. Ruiz noted the applicants have called into the meeting to join the discussion and answer any questions.

Committee Member Thompson inquired if the owner had applied for a demolition permit. Ms. Ruiz defined a demolition as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness and further noted that the committee has the option to remove the home from the Historical Register, or it will proceed as a demolition.

Discussion ensued regarding the reasons for de-listing, insurance burdens, re-building back smaller and newer, thus more insurable.

Kim Ruiz, Planner noted the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Detailing that this particular certificate is entitled to demolition, it reads "removal or demolition of a Historical Property" with seven criteria listed. The Historical Committee is tasked to go through the 7 criteria and determine which are effective.

Mr. Young called into the meeting to clarify the issue being the availability of insurance not the affordability.

Discussion ensued regarding the insurance issue, Ms. Ruiz noted discussing the criteria being important to reach resolve for the process.

Chair Gleason went through each of the criteria listed in the staff memorandum.

Planner Ruiz directed the Committee's attention to the attachment within the memorandum, detailing the property owner's responses to the 7 criteria. At which time discussion ensued regarding the 7 criteria and responses by the property owner.

Chair Gleason gave a brief history of the property and the replica home.

Discussion continued regarding the property generating rental income by the home being relocated then renovated or rebuilt for the owners. Mr. Young clarified the reasons for relocation of the building and how that relocation discovered termites and other damages not withstanding to repairs, demolition of the original and rebuild was the only choice for the family. Once the home was rebuilt and replicated, the home

was placed on the register by the City without asking the owners.

The Committee inquired if the owners would consider selling the property if de-listed? Mr. Young answered that all options are on the table.

Chair Gleason noted the cemetery was cleaned up post-storm at the owners expense, and looks great.

Committee Member Thompson agreed it is unfair that the owners were placed on the list without ask and what the benefits are of having a de-listed home. He further expressed concerns about setting precedence.

Discussion ensued regarding the available options for the owners if the committee were to deny de-listing. Committee inquired if the register can be amended to state the home site, excluding the structure of the home, would save the cemetery.

Discussion concluded regarding the reasons for keeping the private cemetery and the benefits for being on the historical register.

Committee Member McLendon moved, seconded by Committee Member Hill to amend the Historical Register to read, the Nutt Family home site and cemetery is preserved Historic, excluding any structures and residential dwellings. The motion carried by a vote of 3-2 with Committee Members Thompson and Norton voting in opposition and Committee Members Adams, Fortney, Goodwin and Pickens excused.

Excused: 4 - Vice Chair Goodwin, Committee Member Adams, Committee Member Fortney and Committee Member Pickens

7. City Council Liaison Report (Vice Mayor Johnson)

Vice Mayor Johnson thanked the committee for their hard work, how this was not an easy vote for anyone but part of the work the committee does. Adding how history is important and important to preserve.

Mr. Johnson further spoke to Lighthouse repair efforts, and work being done at the Historical Village in the spirit of insurance claims.

The Committee inquired about the Community House, which Vice Mayor said he would follow up on. Chair Gleason noted the floor of the North Room was demolished which was not original to the historical structure, but is still standing.

Ms. Ruiz noted all properties have to abide by the Coastal Construction Control Line (CCCL), regardless of status on the Historical Register. Post disaster policy by The Department of Environmental Protection states rebuilds must occur in the same footprint, dimensions, and location of the original, with only the permission to elevate.

8. Sanibel Historical Museum and Village, Inc.

- a. Acquisitions - Emilie Alfino
- b. Monthly Report - Emilie Alfino

Sanibel Historical Museum and Village, Director, Emilie Alfino was not in attendance but reported to Chair Gleason that staff hours have been cut in half and limiting volunteers, due to the type of work needed to be done by contractors, and working with insurance claims. Chair also noted the Director's appreciation for donations by the public.

9. Reports

- a. Chairperson's Report

Public Comment:

- Karen Bell - 50% owner of Lilly and Company, water in store, windows damaged, waiting on replacement for some windows which are on back order. Siding on building is original, trying to keep, pulling away from structure, but trying to salvage, property is up for sale. Kelly Koontz thinking about purchasing it. Interior alterations are allowed inside up to the owners standards, determination of the elevation of the property would need to be determined by our City Building official. FEMA would require any improvements beyond 50% of the building to have the building brought to code, by elevation.

- b. Planning Department Staff Liaison Report

Ms. Ruiz noted reaching out to homes on the register to assess levels of damages and that the owners of Lily and Co, (the old black school house) had reached out to the City to make sure that they were doing all remediation of the building in the right order.

Bailey homestead was severely damaged, but structural work is not anticipated to be needed at this time. The Community Church needs new chapel roof and flooring, even after raising the building.

- c. Committee Member Reports

Chair Gleason gave a brief report regarding future agenda topics, such as a time frame for updating the Sanibel Plan. Ms. Gleason spoke her appreciation for the members in attendance, as travel is difficult at this time. The Historical Village is sound and stabilized, but lots of work ahead, windows popped while buildings were wrapped, concerned village does not have power, library is open and a great source for history

and the website also has historical island information.

10. Next Meeting Date

- a.** February 2, 2023, at 9:00 a.m. at BIG ARTS

11. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:58 a.m.